

National Renewable Energy Laboratory

Innovation for Our Energy Future

# **NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons**

## 22 September – 3 October 2008 (NPC-2008)

T. Stoffel and I. Reda

*Technical Report* NREL/TP-550-45016 February 2009



# **NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons**

## 22 September – 3 October 2008 (NPC-2008)

*Technical Report* NREL/TP-550-45016 February 2009

T. Stoffel and I. Reda

Prepared under Task No(s): 3B10-3000, PVD9.3110, WU1D.5600



National Renewable Energy Laboratory 1617 Cole Boulevard, Golden, Colorado 80401-3393 303-275-3000 • www.nrel.gov

NREL is a national laboratory of the U.S. Department of Energy Office of Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Operated by the Alliance for Sustainable Energy, LLC

Contract No. DE-AC36-08-GO28308

#### NOTICE

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States government. Neither the United States government nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States government or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States government or any agency thereof.

Available electronically at http://www.osti.gov/bridge

Available for a processing fee to U.S. Department of Energy and its contractors, in paper, from: U.S. Department of Energy Office of Scientific and Technical Information P.O. Box 62 Oak Ridge, TN 37831-0062 phone: 865.576.8401 fax: 865.576.5728 email: mailto:reports@adonis.osti.gov

Available for sale to the public, in paper, from: U.S. Department of Commerce National Technical Information Service 5285 Port Royal Road Springfield, VA 22161 phone: 800.553.6847 fax: 703.605.6900 email: <u>orders@ntis.fedworld.gov</u> online ordering: <u>http://www.ntis.gov/ordering.htm</u>



Printed on paper containing at least 50% wastepaper, including 20% postconsumer waste

## Acknowledgements

We sincerely appreciate the support of David Mooney, Director, Electricity, Resources, & Building Systems Integration Center, for helping us host these comparisons. We also thank Beverly Kay for her timely administrative and logistical help; Pete Gotseff for his site and instrument preparations; and Afshin Andreas for providing us with online access to Baseline Measurement System data.

We are also grateful for the support from Bobi Garrett and Daryl Myers who authorized funds from the NREL Metrology Laboratory Technical Overhead and the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE)/National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL) Photovoltaics Research Program. The DOE Atmospheric Radiation Measurement (ARM) Program, funded through Argonne National Laboratory and Pacific Northwest National Laboratory, provided additional support.

The Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos World Radiation Center (PMOD/WRC); The Eppley Laboratory, Inc.; NOAA's Earth System Research Laboratory/Global Monitoring Division; ATLAS Material Testing Technologies LLC/DSET Laboratories, Inc.; and the DOE Office of Science ARM Program provided solar irradiance measurements from reference radiometers with direct traceability to the World Radiometric Reference (WRR). These radiometers greatly strengthened our ability to transfer the WRR to the participating radiometers.

Thanks to each NPC-2008 participant for their patience and cooperation during this weatherdependent exercise.



NPC-2008 Participants. From left (standing): Tom Stoffel, Wim Zaaiman, Don Nelson, Fred Denn, Tom Kirk, David Halliwell, Ibrahim Reda, Mike Edgar, Ed Smith, Mary Watkins, Erik Naranen, Christian Thomann. From left (kneeling): Dan Riley, Bill Boyson, Craig Webb, Anthony Bucholtz, Cary Thompson. Not shown: Jim Goza and Phil Thacher.

## List of Acronyms

Baseline Measurement System
calibration factor
U.S. Department of Energy
International Pyrheliometer Comparison
Tenth International Pyrheliometer Comparisons
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons
NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons
National Renewable Energy Laboratory
Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos World Radiation Center
pooled standard deviation
International System of Units
Solar Radiation Research Laboratory
Transfer Standard Group
World Meteorological Organization
World Radiometric Reference
WRR transfer factor
World Standard Group

### **Executive Summary**

Accurate and continuous long-term measurements of direct-normal (beam) solar irradiance from pyrheliometers<sup>1</sup> are important for the development and deployment of renewable energy conversion systems and other science and technology applications involving solar radiation flux, and ultimately, improving our understanding of the earth's energy budget for climate change studies. Providing these data places many demands on the quality of the system used by the operator of commercially available radiometers. Maintaining accurate radiometer calibrations traceable to an international standard is the first step in producing research-quality solar irradiance measurements.

In 1977, the World Meteorological Organization (WMO) established the *World Radiometric Reference* (WRR) as the international standard for the measurement of direct-normal solar irradiance. The WRR is an internationally recognized, detector-based measurement standard determined by the collective performance of seven electrically self-calibrated absolute cavity radiometers comprising the *World Standard Group* (WSG). Various countries, including the United States<sup>2</sup>, have contributed these specialized radiometers to the Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos World Radiation Center (PMOD/WRC) to help establish the WSG.

Like any measurement system, absolute cavity radiometers and other types of pyrheliometers are subject to performance changes over time. Therefore, every five years, the PMOD/WRC in Davos, Switzerland hosts an International Pyrheliometer Comparison (IPC) for transferring the WRR to participating radiometers. Representing the U.S. Department of Energy (DOE), the National Renewable Energy Laboratory (NREL) has participated in all of the IPCs since 1980. As a result, NREL has developed and maintained a select group of absolute cavity radiometers with direct calibration traceability to the WRR. These instruments are used by NREL to transfer WRR calibration to other radiometers.

*NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons* (NPCs) are held annually at the Solar Radiation Research Laboratory (SRRL) in Golden, Colorado. Open to all pyrheliometer owner/operators, the NPC provides an opportunity to determine the unique WRR transfer factor (WRR-TF) for each participating pyrheliometer. By adjusting all subsequent solar irradiance measurements by the appropriate WRR transfer factor, the operator can establish calibration traceability to the WRR.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Pyrheliometers are a type of radiometer used to measure solar irradiance (i.e., radiant flux in Watts per square meter) on a surface normal to the apparent solar disk within a 5.0° or 5.7° field of view, depending on the optical design of the instrument. A solar tracker is used to maintain proper alignment of the pyrheliometer with the sun during daylight periods.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The WSG includes radiometers on permanent loan from The Eppley Laboratory, Inc. and NREL.



Figure ES-1. NPC-2008 Radiometer Deployment at NREL's Solar Radiation Research Laboratory (SRRL)

NPC-2008 was scheduled from September 22 through October 3, 2008. Twenty-three participants operated 37 absolute cavity radiometers and two conventional thermopile-based pyrheliometers to simultaneously measure clear-sky direct-normal solar irradiance during this period. The Transfer Standard Group (TSG) of reference radiometers for NPC-2008 consisted of three<sup>3</sup> out of the four NREL radiometers with direct traceability to the WRR having participated in the Tenth International Pyrheliometer Comparisons (IPC-X) in the fall of 2005. As the result of NPC-2008, each participating absolute cavity radiometer was assigned a new WRR-TF computed as the reference irradiance determined by the TSG divided by the observed irradiance from the participating radiometer. The performance of the TSG during NPC-2008 was consistent with previous comparisons, including IPC-X. The measurement performance of the TSG allowed the transfer of the WRR to each participating radiometer with an estimated uncertainty of  $\pm$  0.33% with respect to the International Systems of Units.



# Figure ES-2. Ibrahim Reda operates NREL's absolute cavity radiometers on solar trackers. Four DOE/NREL reference standards were used to determine WRR-TFs for participating radiometers.

The comparison protocol is based on data collection periods called *runs*. Each run consists of a six-minute electrical self-calibration, a series of 37 solar irradiance measurements at 20-second intervals, and a post-calibration. More than 1,000 reference irradiance measurements for each

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Historically, there have been four cavity radiometers in the TSG: AHF 28968, AHF 29220, AHF 30713, and TMI 68018. Due to optical contamination discovered during NPC-2008, TMI 68018 was removed from the TSG.

participating radiometer were collected during NPC-2008. Clear-sky daily maximum direct-normal irradiance levels ranged from 941  $Wm^{-2}$  to 1002  $Wm^{-2}$ .

Ancillary environmental parameters (e.g., broadband irradiance, spectral irradiance, and other surface meteorological data) collected at SRRL during the comparison are presented in this report to document the environmental test conditions.

Future NPCs are planned annually at SRRL to ensure worldwide homogeneity of solar radiation measurements traceable to the WRR.

## **Table of Contents**

Ackr	owledgements	i	
Exec	utive Summary	.ii	
1.	Introduction	.1	
2.	Reference Instruments	2	
3.	Measurement Protocol	3	
4.	Transferring World Radiometric Reference	3	
4.1	Calibration Requirements	4	
4.2	2 Determining the Reference Irradiance		
4.3	Data Analysis Criteria	4	
4.4	Measurements	4	
4.5	Results	5	
4.6	Recommendations	27	
5.	Ancillary Data	27	
Refe	rences	28	
Арре	endix A: List of Participants and Pyrheliometers	29	
Арре	endix B: Ancillary Data Summaries	35	
Арре	endix C: Operational Notes	42	

## 1. Introduction

Collecting solar irradiance data for applications in renewable energy technology research, global climate change studies, satellite remote sensing validations, general atmospheric science research, or a myriad of other applications involving the knowledge of solar flux, requires measurements traceable to a recognized calibration reference. The World Radiometric Reference (WRR) is the internationally recognized reference for direct-normal solar irradiance measurements (Fröhlich 1991).

The WRR was established by the World Meteorological Organization (WMO) in 1977 and has been maintained by the Physikalisch-Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos World Radiation Center (PMOD/WRC) in Switzerland (http://www.pmodwrc.ch). This reference is maintained for broadband solar irradiance with an absolute uncertainty of better than ± 0.3% with respect to the International System of Units (SI) (Romero et al. 1996). This standard is widely used for the calibration of shortwave radiometers (pyranometers and pyrheliometers) with a wavelength response range of 280 nm to 3000 nm. Every five years, the WRR is transferred to WMO Regional Centers and other participants in the International Pyrheliometer Comparisons (IPC) held at the PMOD/WRC. The tenth IPC was completed in 2005 (Finsterle 2006). At each IPC, instantaneous measurements from the World Standard Group (WSG) are compared at 90-second intervals with the data from participating radiometers recorded under clear-sky conditions. A new WRR transfer factor (WRR-TF) is calculated for each of the participating radiometers based on the mean WRR of the WSG radiometers for each IPC. Multiplying the irradiance reading of each radiometer by its assigned WRR-TF will result in measurements that are traceable to WRR and therefore consistent with the international reference of solar radiation measurement.

The 2008 NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons (NPC-2008) was scheduled from September 22 to October 3, 2008 at the Solar Radiation Research Laboratory (SRRL) in Golden, Colorado. Twenty-three participants operated 36 absolute cavity radiometers during the comparisons (see Appendix A for a list of participants). The following organizations were represented at NPC-2008:

- Atlas Weathering Services, Inc. DSET Laboratories
- Atmospheric Radiation Measurement Program of the U.S. Department of Energy
- The Eppley Laboratory, Inc.
- Florida Solar Energy Center
- NASA Langley Research Center, Atmospheric Sciences Division
- Naval Research Laboratory
- National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA), Earth System Research Laboratory
- National Renewable Energy Laboratory
  - o Electricity, Resources, and Building Systems Integration Center
  - o Metrology Laboratory
  - o Solar Energy Technologies Program

Weather conditions during the period September 22 to September 27, 2008 were adequate for this year's NPC data collection (see Appendix B for more specific meteorological information). The results presented in this report are based on clear-sky direct-normal solar irradiance data collected on these six days.

### 2. Reference Instruments

Historically, four absolute cavity radiometers maintained by NREL that participated in the most recent IPC are used as the Transfer Standard Group (TSG) to maintain the WRR for the NPC. During the measurement periods of NPC-2008, TMI 68018 was discovered to be consistently measuring low irradiances, about 2% less than the other TSG radiometers. Equipment inspections during the comparisons yielded no apparent cause for the discrepancies. During subsequent investigations, which included the disassembly and visual inspection of the radiometer components, a spider and its web were removed from the precision aperture (see Figure 2.1). This optical obstruction was determined to be the cause of the measurement differences. *Therefore, data from TMI 68108 were not used to determine the WRR for NPC-2008*. Using the method described by Reda (1996), the mean of the remaining TSG measurements was maintained for establishing the reference irradiance data for NPC-2008 data reduction<sup>4</sup>. Table 2.1 provides a list of the TSG absolute cavity radiometers with their WRR reduction factors and pooled standard deviations as determined from the latest International Pyrheliometer Comparisons in 2005 (Finsterle 2006).

Serial Number	WRR Reduction Factor (from IPC-X)	Standard Deviation (%)	Number of Readings
AHF 28968	0.99777	0.0753	911
AHF 29220	0.99756	0.0737	922
AHF 30713	0.99751	0.0668	911
Mean WRR for		Pooled Std Devia	tion for the TSG
the TSG	0.99761	0.0	7%

#### Table 2.1 IPC-X Results Summary for the NPC-2008 TSG

The pooled standard deviation (SDp) for the TSG is computed from the following equation:

$$SD_p \quad = \quad [ \ \sum_{i=0}^m ( \ n_i \ * \ {S_i}^2 \ ) \ / \ \sum_{i=0}^m n_i \ ]^{1/2}$$

where,

i	=	i <sup>th</sup> cavity
m	=	number of reference cavities
$\mathbf{S}_{\mathbf{i}}$	=	standard deviation of the i <sup>th</sup> cavity, from IPC-X
ni	=	number of readings of the i <sup>th</sup> cavity, from IPC-X

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> After the instrument was cleaned and reassembled, comparisons of TMI 68018 with the other TSG radiometers confirmed the measurement performance was restored to historical levels. The storage of all TSG instruments has been improved to prevent future insect intrusion.



Figure 2.1 Inspection of TMI 68018 (left) revealed a spider and its web obstructed the precision aperture (right) resulting in 1.5% to 2.5% lower irradiance measurements when compared to other TSG radiometers.

### 3. Measurement Protocol

The decision to deploy instruments for a comparison is made daily. Data are collected only during clearsky conditions determined visually and from stability of pyrheliometer readings. Simultaneous directnormal solar irradiance measurements were taken by most cavity radiometers in groups of 37 observations at 20-second intervals (PMO6 used 40-second open/closed shutter cycle). Each group of observations is called a *run*. An electrical self-calibration of each absolute cavity is performed just prior to each run. Previous WRR-TFs were <u>not</u> applied to the observations. The original manufacturer calibration factor was used according to the standard operating procedure provided by the manufacturer for each radiometer. A timekeeper announced the beginning of calibration periods and gave a 6-minute countdown prior to the start of each run to facilitate a simultaneous start for each participant (see Appendix C for details).

By consensus, the goal was set to acquire at least 300 observations from each radiometer to determine the WRR-TF. Participants also agreed that a minimum ten runs should be performed over a period of at least three days to provide a variety of temperature and spectral irradiance conditions. The goal was to build a statistically significant data set from which to derive individual WRR-TF.

Data from each radiometer/operator system were collected at the end of the day using USB flash memory drives. Additional operational notes can be found in Appendix C.

## 4. Transferring World Radiometric Reference

The primary purpose of these absolute cavity comparisons is to transfer the WRR from the NPC TSG to each of the participating radiometers. This requires the collection of simultaneous measurements of clear-sky direct-normal (or beam) solar irradiance by the participating radiometers and the TSG.

#### 4.1 Calibration Requirements

Using WMO guidelines (Romero 1995), the following conditions were required before data collection was accomplished during NPC-2008:

- Radiation source was the sun, with irradiance levels greater than 700 Wm-2
- Digital multimeters with accuracy better than 0.05% of reading were used to measure the thermopile signals from each radiometer
- Solar trackers were aligned within  $\pm 0.25^{\circ}$  slope angle
- Wind speed was low (< 5 m/s) from the direction of the solar azimuth  $\pm 30^{\circ}$
- Cloud cover was less than 1/8 with an angular distance larger than  $15^{\circ}$  from the sun.

#### 4.2 Determining the Reference Irradiance

Three absolute cavity radiometers maintained by NREL and that participated in IPC-X, were used as the TSG to transfer the WRR in the comparison. The WRR-TF for each of the TSG is presented in Table 2.1. The reference irradiance at each reading is calculated using the following summarized steps (Reda 1996):

- a. Each irradiance reading of the TSG is divided by the irradiance measured by AHF 28968.
- b. By maintaining the mean of WRR for the TSG, a new WRR-TF for NPC-2008 is recalculated for each of the TSG cavities (Reda 1996).
- c. The reference irradiance for each 20-second observation in a run is computed as the mean of the simultaneous reference irradiances measured by the TSG. The reference irradiance reading for each cavity in the TSG is the irradiance reading of the cavity multiplied by its new WRR-TF calculated in step b.

#### 4.3 Data Analysis Criteria

AHF 28968 was used to check irradiance stability at the time of each comparison reading. Stable irradiance readings are defined to be within 1.0 Wm<sup>-2</sup> during an interval of three seconds centered about the comparison reading, i.e., one second before and one second after the recorded reading. Unstable irradiance readings are marked in the data record and automatically rejected from the data analysis. Historically, this has affected less than 10% of the data collected during an NPC.

Additionally, all calculated ratios of the reference irradiance divided by the test instrument irradiance that deviated from their mean by more than 1.0% were rejected (PMOD/WRC 1996). Typically, data rejected from the analysis in this manner were the result of failed tracker alignment, problems with the pre-calibration, or similar cause for a bias greater than expected from a properly functioning absolute cavity radiometer.

#### 4.4 Measurements

NPC-2008 took place on September 22 to October 3, 2008. The comparisons were completed on September 27, after more than 3,400 data points were collected by the reference cavities from 63 runs completed during six days with the requisite clear-sky conditions. The actual number of readings for each participating radiometer compared with the reference irradiance varies according to the data analysis selection criteria described above. Additionally, some instruments experienced minor data loss due to a variety of problems with the measurement systems and operating difficulties.

#### 4.5 Results

The results for the TSG are presented in Table 4.5.1. To evaluate the performance of these instruments, the standard deviations of each radiometer are monitored during the comparisons. The results suggest successful performance of the TSG during this NPC:

- For the TSG, the NPC-2008 WRR-TFs did not change by more than a fraction of the standard deviation derived during IPC-X in 2005 (see Figure 4.5.1).
- For the control standards, i.e., cavities that participated in IPC-X and NPC-2008, their new WRR-TFs, from NPC-2008, are consistent with their IPC-X results (see Table 4.5.1).

Results for each radiometer participating in NPC-2008 are presented in Table 4.5.2.

Serial Number	WRR (IPC-X)	WRR (NPC-2008)	SD (%)	Number of Readings	U <sub>95</sub> (%)
AHF 31041	0.99629	0.99641	0.05	2865	0.35
AHF 31105	1.00165	1.00127	0.05	1369	0.35
AHF 32455	0.99909	1.00068	0.06	1719	0.35
AHF32448AWX	0.99987	1.00030	0.09	675	0.38
PMO6cc 0401	1.02153	1.02019	0.05	224	0.35
PMO6 81109	0.99841	0.99798	0.07	944	0.36
PMO6 911204	0.99901	0.99973	0.08	955	0.37
AHF 14915	0.99964	0.99954	0.05	3688	0.35
AHF 17142	0.99915	0.99817	0.05	2451	0.35
AHF 18747	1.00268	1.00042	0.09	2849	0.38
AHF 20406	1.00407	1.00198	0.06	2904	0.35
TMI 67502	0.99948	0.99992	0.06	3304	0.35

Table 4.5.1 Summary Results for the Control Standards for NPC-2008

NO.	Serial Number	WRR-TF (NPC-2008)	Std Deviation	%SD	# of Readings	Uncertainty (% w.r.t. SI)
1	AHF 14915	0.99954	0.000530844	0.05	3688	0.35
2	AHF17142	0.99817	0.000460714	0.05	2451	0.35
3	AHF18747	1.00042	0.000948785	0.09	2849	0.38
4	AHF20406	1.00198	0.000601874	0.06	2904	0.35
5	AHF 21182	0.99944	0.000565848	0.06	2640	0.35
6	AHF 23734	0.99761	0.000313995	0.03	3271	0.34
7	AHF 28553	0.99709	0.000454355	0.05	3430	0.35
8	AHF 28964	1.00074	0.000673196	0.07	3444	0.36
9	AHF 29219	1.06316	0.001003922	0.09	3273	0.38
10	AHF 29222	1.05854	0.000805821	0.08	3544	0.37
11	AHF 30494	0.99759	0.000944403	0.09	3196	0.38
12	AHF 30495	0.99730	0.00051585	0.05	3521	0.35
13	AHF 31041	0.99641	0.000471782	0.05	2865	0.35
14	AHF 31104	0.99900	0.000432813	0.04	3259	0.34
15	AHF 31105	1.00127	0.000522191	0.05	1369	0.35
16	AHF 31108	0.99704	0.000554171	0.06	3226	0.35
17	AHF 32452	1.03201	0.00110431	0.11	3255	0.40
18	AHF 32455	1.00068	0.00059834	0.06	1719	0.35
19	AHF 33392	0.99857	0.000551443	0.06	1990	0.35
20	AHF 32448AWX	1.00030	0.000947899	0.09	675	0.38
21	AHF 34320AWX	0.99294	0.000540878	0.05	2894	0.35
22	AHF 34321AWX	0.99457	0.000560289	0.06	2886	0.35
23	CH1 060460	1.00150	0.001553733	0.16	1831	0.45
24	CH1 930018	0.99994	0.002838122	0.28	1844	0.66
25	PMO6 81109	0.99798	0.000715043	0.07	944	0.36
26	PMO6 911204	0.99973	0.000769796	0.08	955	0.37
27	PMO6-cc 0103	0.99842	0.000646085	0.06	501	0.36
28	PMO6-cc 0401	1.02019	0.000534765	0.05	224	0.35
29	PMO6-cc 0803	1.00016	0.000546063	0.05	506	0.35
30	TMI 67502	0.99992	0.000594285	0.06	3304	0.35
31	TMI 67603	0.99977	0.000540898	0.05	3162	0.35
32	TMI 67811	0.99948	0.000783858	0.08	2979	0.37
33	TMI 68017	0.99907	0.001225733	0.12	2767	0.41
34	TMI 68020	1.00026	0.000809904	0.08	3241	0.37
35	TMI 68022	1.00034	0.001171687	0.12	3023	0.41
36	TMI 68835	1.00393	0.00080238	0.08	2474	0.37
37	TMI 69036	1.00042	0.000477065	0.05	487	0.35

Table 4.5.2 Results for Radiometers Participating in NPC-2008



Figure 4.5.1 – History of WRR Factors for NREL Reference Cavities

The uncertainty of the WRR-TFs associated with each participating radiometer with respect to the WRR is calculated using the following formula:

$$U_{95} = \pm [(2 * 0.07)^2 + (2 * SD)^2]^{1/2}$$

where,

U <sub>95</sub>	=	Uncertainty of the WRR-TF (in percent) determined at NPC-2008 with 95% confidence level
0.07	=	Pooled standard deviation of the three reference radiometers (TSG) that participated in IPC-X (September/October 2005).
SD	=	One standard deviation of the WRR-TF (in percent) determined at NPC-2008 for each participating cavity.

The uncertainty of the WRR transfer factors associated with each participating radiometer with respect to International System of Units (SI) was calculated using the following formula:

$$U_{95} = \pm \left[ (0.3)^2 + (2 * 0.07)^2 + (2 * SD)^2 \right]^{1/2}$$

where,

0.3 is the uncertainty  $(\pm\%)$  of the WRR scale with respect to SI units.

The statistical analyses of WRR-TFs for 37 participating radiometers are presented in Figures 4.5.2 through

4.5.38. These graphical summaries indicate the mean, standard deviation, and frequency of occurrence of the WRR-TFs determined during NPC-2008.







































#### 4.6 Recommendations

As a result of these comparisons, we suggest the participants observe the following measurement practices:

- For the purpose of pyrheliometer comparisons, such as NPC-2008, we recommend the user apply only the manufacturer's calibration factor (CF), not the WRR-TF or the new calibration factor, to report his/her absolute cavity radiometer's irradiance readings. This eliminates the possibility of compounding WRR factors from previous comparisons.
- For data collection in the field, the manufacturer's CF is used to calculate the cavity responsivity. Each irradiance reading is then *multiplied* by the appropriate WRR-TF.

For future comparisons, we strongly urge the participants to provide their irradiance readings in the following format:

Serial Number ##, HH:MM:SS, IRR

where,

Serial Number	=	Instrument serial number (first line only)
##	=	Reading number (1 to 37) within the Run
HH:MM:SS	=	Hour, minute and second of the reading
		(Local Standard Time, 24-hour clock)
IRR	=	Computed irradiance (Wm-2)
		with resolution of XXXX.X

The file naming convention is suggested to include the radiometer serial number and date of observations (e.g., *AHF307130922.08* would correspond to data from AHF30713 on 9/22/08).

## 5. Ancillary Data

The meteorological data, i.e. temperature, relative humidity and barometric pressure were measured during the comparisons using the meteorological station at SRRL. A NIP, PSP, and Model 8-48 were also used to measure direct, global, and diffuse irradiances, respectively. These radiometers are used in SRRL's Baseline Measurement System (BMS). The BMS provides one-minute averages of three-second samples. Additional information, including data and graphical summaries, can be found at the Measurements and Instrumentation Data Center at <a href="http://www.nrel.gov/midc/srrl\_bms">http://www.nrel.gov/midc/srrl\_bms</a>.

Time-series plots and other graphical presentations of these data are presented in Appendix B.

## References

Finsterle, W. (2006). "WMO International Pyrheliometer Comparison, IPC-X, 26 September – 14 October 2005, Davos, Switzerland, Final Report." IOM Report No. 91, WMO/TD No. 1320, 65 pp.

Fröhlich, C. (1991). "History of Solar Radiometry and the World Radiometric Reference." *Metrologia* (28:3).

Reda, I. (1996). "Calibration of a Solar Absolute Cavity Radiometer with Traceability to the World Radiometric Reference." NREL/TP-463-20619. Golden, Co: National Renewable Energy Laboratory.

Romero, J. (1995). "Direct Solar Irradiance Measurements with Pyrheliometers: Instruments and Calibrations." IPC-VIII, Davos, Switzerland, 16 pp.

Romero, J; Fox, N.P.; Fröhlich, C. (May 1996). "Improved Comparison of the World Radiometric Reference and the SI Radiometric Scale." *Metrologia* (32:6); pp. 523-524.

PMOD/WRC (1996). "International Pyrheliometer Comparison, IPC VIII, 25 September - 13 October 1995, Results and Symposium, Working Report." IOM Report No. 188, Swiss Meteorological Institute, Dorfstrasse 33, CH-7260 Davos Dorf, Switzerland, 115 pp.

*Note:* Digital images taken during NPC-2008 are available from the ARM Instrument Management (AIM) Web site at <u>http://www.nrel.gov/aim/npc</u>.

## Appendices

#### Appendix A: List of Participants and Pyrheliometers

#### NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons (NPC-2008) 22 September - 3 October 2008

#### List of Participants

Name / Ad	ddress / Phone / Fax / E-mail	Radiometer(s)
Bill Boys	on	TMI 67603
Sandia Na	ational Laboratories	AHF 31108
MS 1033		
Photovolta	aic Systems Evaluation Lab	
P.O. Box	5800	
Albuquerc	jue, NM 87185-1033	
Phone:	505-844-5979	
Fax:	505-844-4566	
E-mail:	weboyso@sandia.gov	
Anthony	Bucholtz	AHF 33392
Naval Res	search Laboratory	
7 Grace ⊢	lopper Street, Stop 2	
Monterey,	CA 93943-5502	
Phone:	831-656-5024	
Fax:	831-656-4769	
E-mail:	Anthony.bucholtz@nrlmry.navy.mil	
Victor Ca	ssella (sending instrument)	PMO6-cc 0103
Kipp & Zo	nen	
125 Wilbu	r Place	
Bohemia,	NY 11716	
Phone:	631-589-2065	
Fax:	631-589-2068	
E-mail:	victor.cassella@kippzonen.com	
Fred Den	n	AHF 31041
Science S	systems & Applications, Inc.	AHF 31105
NASA Lar	ngley	
1 Enterpri	se Parkway, Suite 200	
Hampton,	VA 23666-5845	
Phone:	757 951-1636	
Fax:	757-951-1902	
E-mail:	Frederick.M.Denn@nasa.gov	

Mike Edgar		TMI 68022
Sandia Nati	onal Laboratories	TMI 67811
MS 1127		
P.O. Box 58	300	
Albuquerqu	e, NM 87185-1127	
Phone:	505-845-3441	
Fax:	505-844-4566	
Email:	rmedgar@sandia.gov	
Keith Emer	<b>Y</b> – sending radiometer	AHF 23734
National Re	newable Energy Laboratory	
1617 Cole E	Blvd., Mail Stop 3215	
Golden, CO	80401-3393	
Phone:	303-384-6632	
Fax:	303-384-6604	
E-mail:	keith_emery@nrel.gov	
Jim Goza		TMI 68020
Lockheed M	1artin Mission Services	
PO Box 179	), MS P9682	
Littleton, CO	D 80127	
Phone:	303-977-8195	
Fax:	303-971-5653	
E-mail:	james.c.goza@Imco.com	
David Halli	well	AHF 18747
Environmer	nt Canada	AHF 20406
BSRN Obse	ervatory Site Scientist	AHF 34320AWX
PO Box 160	)	AHF 34321AWX
Wilcox, SK	S0G 5E0	
Canada		
Phone:	306-352-3818	
Fax:	306-546-6400	
E-mail:	david.halliwell@ec.gc.ca	

### Tom Kirk

The Eppley Laboratory, Inc. 12 Sheffield Ave. Newport, RI 02840 Phone: 401-847-1020 Fax: 401-847-1031 E-mail: info@eppleylab.com AHF 14915

#### P.O. Box 5800 Albuquerque, NM 87185-1127

Tim Moss

MS 1127

 Phone:
 505-845-3600

 Fax:
 505-844-4566

 Email:
 tmoss@sandia.gov

Sandia National Laboratories

#### Erik Naranen

Atlas Material Testing DSET Laboratories 45601 N. 47<sup>th</sup> Ave. Phoenix, AZ 85087 Phone: 623-465-7356 Ext. 162 Fax: 623-465-9409 E-mail: ENaranen@ATLAS-MTS.com

#### Don Nelson

NOAA/ESRL/GMD					
Global Monito	oring Division				
M/S R/CMD	M/S R/CMDL1				
325 Broadway					
Boulder, CO	80305				
Phone:	303-497-6662				
Fax:	303-497-6290				
E-mail:	donald.w.nelson@noaa.gov				

#### Ibrahim Reda

National Renewable Energy Laboratory			
1617 Cole Blvd.			
Golden, CO	80401-3393		
Phone:	303-384-6385		
Fax:	303-384-6391		
E-mail:	ireda@tcplink.nrel.gov		

#### Dan Riley

Sandia National Laboratories PO Box 5800, MS 1033 Albuquerque, NM 87185-1033 Phone: 505-844-7356 Fax: 505-844-1504 E-mail: driley@sandia.gov TMI 68022 TMI 67811

AHF 17142

AHF 28553 AHF 32448AWX AHF 30710 TMI 67502

AHF 23734 AHF 28968 AHF 29219 AHF 29220 AHF 30494 AHF 30713 AHF 31104 AHF 32452AWX TMI 68017 TMI 68018

TMI 68022 TMI 67811

MS 1127 P.O. Box 580	00	
Albuquerque	. NM 87185-1127	
Phone:	505-845-3600	
Fax:	505-844-4566	
Email:	ejsmit@sandia.gov	
Tom Stoffel		AHF 14915
National Ren	ewable Energy Laboratory	(alternate)
1617 Cole Bl	vd.	
Golden, CO	80401-3393	
Phone:	303-384-6395	
Fax:	303-384-6391	
E-mail:	thomas_stonel@hrel.gov	
Phil Thache	r	TMI 67603
Sandia Natio	nal Laboratories	AHF 31108
MS 0665		
Primary Stan	dards Laboratory	
P.U. BOX 580		
Phone.	505-898-4345	
Thome.	or 505-844-4452	
Email:	pdthach@sandia.gov (pdthacher@comcast.	.net)
Christian Th	omann	AHF 32455
Physikalisch-	Meteorologisches Observatorium Davos	PMO6-cc 0401
World Radiat	ion Center (PMOD/WRC)	
Dorfstrasse 3	33	
CH-7260 Day	vos Dorf	
Switzerland		
Phone:	41 814 175 140	
Fax:	41 814 175 100	
E-mail:	Christian.thomann@pmodwrc.ch	
Cary Thomp	son	TMI 68020
Lockheed Ma	artin Mission Services	
PO Box 179,	MS P9682	
Littleton, CO	80127	
Phone:	303-977-0208	
Fax:	303-9/1-5635	
⊨-mail:	cary.1.tnompson@imco.com	

TMI 68022

TMI 67811

**Ed Smith** 

Sandia National Laboratories

#### **Mary Watkins**

Florida Solar Energy Center 1679 Clearlake Road Cocoa, FL 32922-5703 Phone: 321-638-1513 Fax: 321-638-1010 E-mail: MWatkins@fsec.ucf.edu

#### Craig Webb

Atmospheric	AHF 29222	
ARM Progra	AHF 30495	
309600 EN	/ 28	
Billings, OK	74630-2045	
Phone:	580-388-4053	
Fax:	580-388-4052	
E-mail:	craigw@ops.sgp.arm.gov	

#### Jim Wendell

Jim Wend	dell	TMI 67502
NOAA/ES	RL/GMD	AHF 28553
R/GMD1		AHF 32448AWX
325 Broad	dway	AHF 30710
Boulder, C	CO 80305	
Phone:	303-497-6694	
Fax:	303-497-6290	
E-mail:	jim.wendell@noaa.gov	

#### Wim Zaaiman

European Commission Directorate General JRC **Environment Institute Renewable Energies Unit** Building 45, TP450 Via Fermi, 1 I-21020 Ispra (Va), Italy Phone: + 39 0 332 785 750 Fax: +39 0 332 789 628 E-mail: willem.zaaiman@jrc.it

PMO6 81109 PMO6 911204 TMI 68835 CH1 060460 CH1 930018

AHF 28964

## List of Pyrheliometers

<u>No.</u>	<u>Serial No</u> .	Owner / Application
1	AHF 14915	The Eppley Laboratory, Inc. / Primary Reference Standard
2	AHF 17142	Atlas Weathering Services-DSET / Primary Reference Standard
3	AHF 18747	Environment Canada / Primary Reference Standard
4	AHF 20406	Environment Canada / Primary Reference Standard
5	AHF 21182	FSEC / Primary Reference Standard
6	AHF 23734	NREL / Photovoltaics Program Reference
7	AHF 28553	NOAA Global Monitoring Division (GMD) / Reference
8	AHF 28964	DOE ARM / Southern Great Plains Site Reference
9	AHF 29219	NREL/Metrology Lab windowed cavity
10	AHF 29222	DOE ARM-Southern Great Plains / All-Weather
11	AHF 30494	NREL/Metrology Lab
12	AHF 30495	DOE ARM-Southern Great Plains Working Standard
13	AHF 31041	NASA Clouds and the Earth's Radiant Energy System (CERES) / Reference
14	AHF 31104	NREL / Metrology Lab BORCAL Transfer Standard
15	AHF 31105	NASA / CERES Reference 2
16	AHF 31108	Sandia National Laboratories / PV Reference Standard
17	AHF 32455	PMOD/WRC / Transfer Standard
18	AHF 34320AWX	Environment Canada / All-Weather Reference
19	AHF 34321AWX	Environment Canada / All-Weather Reference
20	AHF 32448AWX	NOAA/GMD / All Weather
21	AHF 32452AWX	NREL / All-Weather Transfer Standard
22	AHF 33392	Naval Research Laboratory / Primary Reference Standard
23	CH1 930018	European Commission Directorate General / Control Standard
24	CH1 060460	European Commission Directorate General / Control Standard
25	PMO6-cc 0103	Kipp & Zonen
26	PMO6-cc 0401	PMOD/WRC / Transfer Standard
27	PMO6 81109	European Commission Directorate General / Reference Standard
28	PMO6 911204	European Commission Directorate General / Reference Standard
29	PMO6-cc 0803	PMOD
30	TMI 67502	NOAA GMD / Reference Standard
31	TMI 67603	Sandia National Laboratories / Primary Reference Standard
32	TMI 67811	Sandia National Laboratories / Central Receiver Test Facility (CRTF)
33	TMI 68017	NREL / SRRL All-Weather BORCAL Working Standard #2
34	TMI 68020	Lockheed Martin Mission Services /Primary Reference Standard
35	TMI 68022	Sandia National Laboratories / CRTF
36	TMI 68835	European Commission Directorate General / Control Standard
37	TMI 69036	NREL Metrology Lab / BORCAL Working Standard #3

#### Summary:

Absolute Cavity Radiometers				
Thermopile Pyrheliometers	2			

#### **Appendix B: Ancillary Data Summaries**

The measurement performance of an absolute cavity can be affected by several environmental parameters. Potentially relevant meteorological data collected during the NPC are presented in this appendix. The Baseline Measurement System (BMS) has been in continuous operation at the Solar Radiation Research Lab (SRRL) since 1985. BMS data are recorded as 1-minute averages of 3-second samples for each instrument. Additional information about SRRL and the BMS can be found at our Measurement & Instrumentation Data Center at http://www.nrel.gov/midc/srrl\_bms.

Time-series plots and other graphical presentations of these data acquired during the NPC-2008 measurements are presented here.

#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 22, 2008



#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 23, 2008



**Barometric Pressure** 

#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 24, 2008



#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 25, 2008



**Barometric Pressure** 

#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 26, 2008



#### Baseline Measurement System Data for September 27, 2008



**Barometric Pressure** 

#### Appendix C: Operational Notes

The following text was distributed to the participants at the opening of the NPC.

#### 2008 NREL Pyrheliometer Comparisons (NPC-2008) Solar Radiation Research Laboratory Protocol Summary Tom Stoffel and Ibrahim Reda

#### 1. Schedule

Daily Please call Tom's voice mail (303-384-6395) for recorded announcements.

DAY # 1 Sept. 22<sup>th</sup> (morning)

- a. Visitor check-in at Site Entrance Building. Please plan to arrive at NREL between 07:30 and 08:30 MDT.
- b. Transport equipment to SRRL (dry weather) or to indoor lab (TBD) if it's wet outside. (You should have heard from Bev or Tom about any items received prior to the NPC.)
- c. Safety and SRRL orientation briefing.
- d. Equipment Installation & tests:

-ALL personal computers can be *scanned for viruses* prior to their use at SRRL. NREL will provide this service.

-We will have a *seating diagram* to accommodate operator/solar tracker assignments, but we'll see how this works once every one has arrived.

- e. Continue equipment tests as needed.
- f. Review measurement protocol and procedures.
- g. Dry-run(s) of comparison measurements (weather permitting)

<u>Sept. 23<sup>rd</sup> – Oct. 3<sup>rd</sup></u> (Daily, including the weekend):

- a. Clear sky = Take Measurements!
  - -Arrive at SRRL by 08:00 MDT

-Equipment warm-up for at least 30-minutes

-First Cavity Calibration at 08:55 MDT

-Begin comparison "Runs" by 09:00 MDT (08:00 MST)

-Continue measurements until sundown or clouds interfere.

b. Cloudy sky = No Measurements, but optionally...

-Review of previous day's data analyses

- -Technical Briefings on Radiometry, Measurement Network Operations, etc.
- -Equipment Tests
- -NREL Tours

-Office Time (e-mail connection available)

c. We will determine the need for more measurements at the end of each day.

#### 2. SRRL Coordinates

Program your solar tracker using:

 $LAT = 39.7425^{\circ}$  North LON = 105.1778° West ELEV = 1828.8 m Above Mean Sea Level (6,000 ft) BARO = 820 mBar (average station pressure)

#### 3. Time Keeping

-Wim Zaaiman will again be our time keeper (as long as his voice holds out!)

-All time records will be Mountain Standard Time (MST)

-The NIST atomic clock is a local call: 9-303-499-7111.

-We need to keep all PC clocks in agreement to better than 2 sec.

-Set your system clock at the daily start-up or as often as needed to keep 2-second accuracy. Check personal computer clocks during the day.

#### 4. Minimum Data Set

Our goal for a minimum data set for these comparisons is to measure irradiance during three different days (all day or portion). Historically, we have acquired more 3,000 data values for each participating cavity radiometer. At least 300 data values are needed to provide a valid transfer of the WRR to the participating radiometers.

#### 5. Measurements

- > Do <u>NOT</u> apply any previous WRR correction factors to your measurements.
- Use <u>only</u> the factory calibration factor to adjust your data beyond any other adjustments you feel are needed to correct your data (e.g., pre- and post-calibration drifts in sensitivity are OK). As in the past, we will use the following terms:
- "Calibrate" = Perform electrical calibration and wait for next measurement period to begin
- "Reading" = A measurement of direct irradiance within 1 sec of announcement at 20-sec intervals.

"Run" = Collection of 37 readings taken in sequence.

The *Time Keeper* will make the following announcements for each Run:

Next Run Begins at HH:MM (MST) [HH:MM (MDT)] T minus 6 minutes. BEGIN CALIBRATION T minus 3 minutes T minus 2 minutes T minus 1 minute T minus 30 sec T minus 10 sec T minus 5 - 4 - 3 - 2 - 1 - READ!

Continued countdowns at 20 sec intervals until 37 readings have completed a "Run"

#### 6. Data Transfer

The following *standard data format* will be used by each participant to improve our data processing efficiency.

a. Single instrument per file:

#### YYYYMMDD,HH:MM:SS,NNNNN,XXXX.XX

#### b. Multiple instrument per file: YYYYMMDD,HH:MM:SS,NNNNN,XXXX,XX,NNNNN,XXXX.XX,...

Where,

YYYY	=	Year				
MM	=	Month				
DD	=	Day of Mo	onth			
HH	=	Hour (Mou	untain	Standa	rd Time)	
MM	=	Minute	"	"	"	
SS	=	Second	"	"	"	
NNNNN	=	Radiomete	er Seri	al Num	ber ( <u>not</u> limit	ed to 5 figures)
XXXX.XX	=	Irradiance	(Watt	s per so	quare meter)	

After the last daily RUN, and *before* equipment tear-down, our Data Keeper (Reda) will circulate a *master USB Flash Drive or Diskette* for you to copy all of your corrected data. Cavity calibration files are not needed.

#### 7. Data Processing

-Reda has developed an Excel spreadsheet system for reducing the data.

#### 8. Data Reporting

-Our goal is to provide each participant with next-day analyses. -A final report will be published by NREL within two months of the comparisons.

#### 9. Equipment Storage

-Each participant will be given space to store systems at SRRL. -Please let us know if you wish to have any electronics connected to AC power while in storage.

#### 10. Courtesies

-Please get permission before touching someone else's equipment (turning off power strips, adjusting trackers, etc.) to prevent inadvertent data loss. -Please return borrowed tools to owner.

#### 11. Dinner on <u>Wednesday</u> (September 24<sup>th</sup>)

\*\* Note New Date\*\*

Please join us for an Italian dinner at the Wilcox residence! (Directions to be provided)

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE				Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188		
The public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing the burden, to Department of Defense, Executive Services and Communications Directorate (0704-0188). Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number.						
1. REPORT DATE (DD-MM-YYYY)	2. REPORT TYPE	-		3. DATES COVERED (From - To)		
February 2009	Technical Report					
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE			5a. CON	ITRACT NUMBER		
NREL Pyrheliometer Comparis	ons: 22 September - 3	October 2008	DE-	AC36-08-GO28308		
(NCP-2008)			5b. GRA	5b. GRANT NUMBER		
			5c. PRO	GRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
6. AUTHOR(S)			5d. PRO	JECT NUMBER		
T. Stoffel and I Reda			NR	EL/TP-550-45016		
			Fo TAC			
			381 3R1			
			301	0.3000,1 709.3110, WOTE.3000		
			5f. WOF			
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAM	IE(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)			8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION		
National Renewable Energy La	boratory					
1617 Cole Blvd.				NREL/1P-550-45016		
Golden, CO 80401-3393						
9. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENC	CY NAME(S) AND ADDRES	S(ES)		10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S) NREL		
				11. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY REPORT NUMBER		
12. DISTRIBUTION AVAILABILITY STATEMENT						
National Technical Information	Service					
U.S. Department of Commerce						
5285 Port Royal Road						
Springfield, VA 22161						
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES						
14. ABSTRACT (Maximum 200 Words)						
NREL Pyrheliometer Comparis	ons (NPCs) are held ar	nnually at the S	olar Rad	diation Research Laboratory (SRRL) in		
Golden, Colorado. Open to all pyrheliometer owner/operators, the NPC provides an opportunity to determine the						
unique WRR transfer factor for	unique WRR transfer factor for each participating pyrheliometer. This paper reports on the results of NPC-2008,					
which was scheduled from September 22 to October 3, 2008.						
15. SUBJECT TERMS						
NREL; National Renewable Energy Laboratory: SRRL: pyrheliometer: World Radiometric Reference: WRR: World						
Standard Group; WSG; solar ir	radiance		-	· · ·		
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF: 17. LIMITATION 18. NUMBER 19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON			DF RESPONSIBLE PERSON			
a. REPORT b. ABSTRACT c. THIS PA	AGE OF ABSTRACT	OF PAGES				
Unclassified Unclassified Unclass	sified UL	1	9b. TELEPH	HONE NUMBER (Include area code)		
				Standard Form 209 (Pay 9/09)		

Standard	Form	298 (	Rev.	8/98
Prescribed b	y ANSI S	Std. Z3	9.18	